

Evaluation Report

EVALUATION AND RECOMMENDATION OF AN AWARD FOR THE PROVISION OF PROJECT/CONSTRUCTION MANAGEMENT SERVICES IN CONNECTION WITH THE FREEHOLD BOROUGH BOARD OF EDUCATION (A) PARK AVENUE ELEMENTARY SCHOOL AND (B) FREEHOLD LEARNING CENTER ELEMENTARY SCHOOL PROJECT

Dated: April 4, 2017

This report is prepared for the reasons explained herein.

The Freehold Borough Board of Education in the County of Monmouth, New Jersey, undertook the solicitation of qualifications and proposals for construction management services, as captioned above. The requirements for these services was outlined in the Board of Education's request for qualifications ("RFQ") entitled, "REQUEST FOR QUALIFICATIONS FOR THE PROVISION OF PROJECT/CONSTRUCTION MANAGEMENT SERVICES IN CONNECTION WITH THE FREEHOLD BOROUGH BOARD OF EDUCATION (A) PARK AVENUE ELEMENTARY SCHOOL AND (B) FREEHOLD LEARNING CENTER ELEMENTARY SCHOOL PROJECT", which will be referred to in this report as the "RFQ."

Although the RFQ contemplates an eventual award of construction management services as Extraordinary Unspecifiable Services as a matter of law, it was deemed in the best interests of the District to engage in an open and competitive process to solicit responses and evaluate them in accordance with the criteria set forth in the RFQ. The New Jersey Schools Development Authority, which is providing certain Section 15 Grant funds for the Projects, has also approved of the RFQ as to form.

The RFQ was advertised in the Asbury Park Press on February 8, 2017, and was also included on the School District's website. The District received and responded to three (3) Requests for Information during the solicitation process. Proposals and responses were received at 10:00am on Wednesday, March 1, 2017, at the District's Administrative Offices in the Park Avenue Elementary School. Proposals were timely received from the following companies: Mast Construction ("Mast"); Legacy Construction Management ("Legacy"); Remington & Vernick ("Remington"); Greyhawk Construction Management ("Greyhawk"); Pinnacle Construction Management ("Pinnacle"); Spiezle Architectural Group ("Spiezle"); New Road Construction ("New Road"); Epic Management ("Epic"); and, P.W. Moss ("PW").

The Board of Education established the following criteria for review of the proposals for an eventual award pursuant to *N.J.S.A. 18A:18A-5(a)(2)*:

No. 1. Experience and reputation in the field (40% of Evaluation; or, up to 40 Points)

Respondents were required to provide a description of their company background, and were evaluated on their experience providing construction management services to public school districts. Respondents were additionally required to list their Board of Education clients and project references, and to demonstrate experience with K-12 school districts of similar size to Freehold.

No. 2. Knowledge of the District, and of the subject matter of the Project addressed under the RFQ (30% of Evaluation; or, up to 30 Points)

No. 3. Availability to accommodate required meetings of the District, and the requirements of the Project (10% of Evaluation; or, up to 10 Points)

Respondents were asked to provide information detailing their ability to meet Project requirements and meetings of the District relative to it, including Board meetings and the provision of sufficient personnel to oversee all aspects of the Project. Respondents were also required to provide the names of the individuals who would perform services in connection with this Project, and a description of their ability to provide services in a timely fashion. That included a description of their staffing, and their familiarity with the services required by the Freehold School District.

No. 4. Other factors demonstrated to be in the best interest of the District (20% of Evaluation; or, up to 20 Points)

In the interests of ensuring that the District had a full and thorough record on which to evaluate all responders, the District elected to conduct interviews with all nine (9) responders.

Based on these criteria, each of the proposals received the following ratings:

Criteria	Mast	Legacy	Remington	Greyhawk	Pinnacle	Spiezle	New Road	Epic	P.W.
Experience (Up to 40)	37	34	35	36	38	32	39	37	36
Knowledge (Up to 30)	25	30	25	25	29	28	28	26	26
Availability (Up to 10)	9	6	7	8	8	6	10	7	6
Other (Up to 20)	17	17	15	15	18	14	19	15	14
TOTAL	88	87	82	84	93	80	96	85	82

The three (3) top responders were then negotiated with in descending order per the RFQ, and as applicable, provided the following rates for the proposed services:

New Road

Phase	Duration	Price Per Month	Hourly Rate	Not to Exceed	Total
Pre-Construction			\$120/hour	\$28,500	\$28,500
Construction (1 school)	2 months	\$23,850			\$47,700
Construction	14 months	\$37,900			\$530,600
Post Occupancy	2 months	\$23,500	\$100/hour	\$23,500/per month	\$47,000
					Total: \$653,800

Pinnacle

Phase	Duration	Price Per Month	Total
Pre-Construction	2 months	\$10,966	\$21,932
Construction	14 month	\$34,937.50	\$489,125
Construction/Close-Out (Option 1- 1 full-time)	4 months	\$21,850	\$87,400
Construction/Close-Out (Option 2- 2 full-time)	4 months	\$34,937.50	\$139,750
			Total:\$598,457 (Option 1) \$650,807 (Option 2)

Mast

Phase	Duration	Price Per Month	Total
Pre-Construction	2 months	\$6,400	\$12,800
Bid/Award	1 month	\$6,400	\$6,400
Construction	14 months	\$32,600	\$456,400
Close Out	3 months	\$15,400	\$46,200
			Total: \$521,800

NARRATIVE ANALYSIS OF EACH EVALUATION CATEGORY

No. 1. Experience and reputation in the field

Company	Commentary
Mast	Had worked on over 200 projects, and currently serves as construction manager with respect to Hudson County Vocational School, a \$160 million job.
Legacy	Like P.W. Moss, also a smaller firm. Exclusively offers construction management services, and has served as such in connection with 24-25 school districts, including Holmdel, Freehold and Bloomfield. Also

	general CM experience (i.e., Columbus Circle referenced example).
Remington	Serves as construction manager to 7 school districts, and engineer of record to 20 of them. 250 total current clients generally.
Greyhawk	Greyhawk has experience with school projects, including a \$19 million, 6 school project in Haddonfield, as well as experience with Willingboro, both southern New Jersey districts.
Pinnacle	Pinnacle has experience with larger educational projects, including Union County Community College, as well as Phillipsburg High School, a \$90 million project. They also have current experience with Franklin Township (Somerset County), where they are working on projects that are nearly identical to those proposed by Freehold (i.e., renovations/additions).
Spiezle	Spiezle's experience is chiefly in architectural and design work for a host of entities, including school districts. They appear to be trying to develop further a construction management practice.
New Road	New Road has a strong central and southern New Jersey presence. They have been providing construction management services since 1988 for school districts, including Pt. Pleasant, Delran and Burlington Township B/Es, and provided construction management services for 37 projects in the past year alone.
Epic	Epic has completed 127 K-12 programs as construction manager since 1995. It also possesses broad Monmouth based experience, including County, school and municipal projects, as either a construction manager or as architect.
P.W.	While a small firm based in PA, P.W. clearly does a fair amount of school work in Monmouth County. Have done projects in Avon, Little Silver, Spring Lake, etc.

No. 2. Knowledge of the District, and of the subject matter of the Project addressed under the RFQ

Company	Commentary
Mast	Possessed a general, basic understanding of the 2 Projects, and of the District's needs, per interview and written proposal. Clearly Mast's projects are oriented towards northern New Jersey.
Legacy	Legacy's principals actually served as construction managers, with their prior firm, on the last Borough renovation and expansion project for the Park Avenue School. Thus quite knowledgeable.
Remington	Possessed a general, basic understanding of the 2 Projects, and of the District's needs, per interview and written proposal.
Greyhawk	Possessed a general, basic understanding of the 2 Projects, and of the District's needs, per interview and written proposal.
Pinnacle	Pinnacle knows the District fairly well, being familiar with the Borough construction department, as well as its architect. It also possessed a general understanding of the 2 Projects, and of the District's needs, per their interview and written proposal. One of their staff members

	maintains an office right within the Borough.
Spiezle	As certain of its principals live local (Freehold Township), they possess a pretty good understanding of the 2 Projects, and the District's general needs.
New Road	Possessed a general understanding of the 2 Projects, and of the District's needs, per interview and written proposal. New Road is also knowledgeable vis-à-vis their Monmouth work (Pt. Pleasant) and extensive K-12 work.
Epic	Possessed a general, understanding of the 2 Projects, and of the District's needs, per interview and written proposal. It was also knowledgeable vis-à-vis its Monmouth work across many types of public entities.
P.W.	Possessed a general, basic understanding of the 2 Projects, and of the District's needs, per interview and written proposal. Also were knowledgeable vis-à-vis their Monmouth work.

No. 3. Availability to accommodate required meetings of the District, and the requirements of the Project

Company	Commentary
Mast	Mast possesses 16 people, represents that staff would be available, including 2 on site, every day. Mast's offices are located in Little Falls, where presumably this project will be overseen from.
Legacy	Legacy has 4 full time CMs, and proposes 2 of them for this Project.
Remington	Although possessing over 80 staff construction managers, Remington's regional office is in Toms River, which is the office this Project will be overseen from.
Greyhawk	Greyhawk has 40 full time staff, and proposed 2 full-time CMs for this project, 1 at each site.
Pinnacle	As noted above, one of their staff architects maintains an office in the Borough. Pinnacle has 10 full time construction managers, and proposes to have 2, full time CMs on this Project.
Spiezle	Spiezle possesses 13 staff with a construction background, including a principal who lives in Freehold Township. They envision 1 full time site manager, possibly 2.
New Road	New Road possesses 25 construction managers, and recommends 2 full time construction managers for these Projects on site.
Epic	Epic possesses approximately 20 site managers, and represents that it would be on-site for these Projects, every day.
P.W.	P.W. possesses 6 construction managers, including an architect. While headquartered in Doylestown, PA, P.W. represents that principals and employees are proximate to the Borough.

No. 4. Other factors demonstrated to be in the best interest of the District

Company	Commentary
---------	------------

Mast	From working with large Hudson County area school projects (Vo Tech, Community College Culinary, etc.), Mast clearly has deep experience. It is not local Monmouth based experienced, but it is significant.
Legacy	As noted they have knowledge of the last renovations undertaken by the Borough. They also have SDA experience, which would be pertinent to this Project.
Remington	Although clearly possessing pertinent experience in construction management and engineering, school district work constitutes a smaller percentage of their overall current client base.
Greyhawk	Like some other responders, Greyhawk also utilized and relied upon software for tracking the status and progress of projects, a software package with various levels of permission and access, from Project owner down the line.
Pinnacle	Notably, Pinnacle brought a MEP proposed team member to their interview, which is significant considering the amount of mechanical work involved here. They also have a working relationship and knowledge of SDA.
Spiezle	While Spiezle possesses some 43 K-12 references, as noted above, its experience largely lies in architectural and design build work. Many of its staff are LEED certified, and are registered architects.
New Road	In addition to the foregoing, New Road's proposed construction manager for this Project actually worked for SDA for 3 years. As this is a Grant 15 funded Project that is significant. A cooperative approach to working with stakeholders to resolve problems (i.e., Burlington B/E roof delay example) was encouraging.
Epic	Epic clearly had broad based experience that touches upon many type of public entities, including Counties, schools and municipalities. While Epic highlighted high profile Monmouth County experience, a good portion of that focused upon municipal work (post-Sandy boardwalk and pavilion replacement), as well as County work (Sheriff, Fire Academy).
P.W.	P.W. clearly has Monmouth based school experience as a construction manager. They are however, a smaller firm, the smallest of the responders to the RFQ.

CONCLUSION AND AWARD RECOMMENDATION

For the reasons outlined in this report, a contract for construction management services for the upcoming Projects is being recommended to New Road, based upon its proposal submitted March 1, 2017. Specifically, this recommendation to award is based on: the specific experience, knowledge, skills, and abilities to serve the unique needs of the District's construction project, work collaboratively with the administration, our representatives, the SDA and ultimately serve in the Board's best interest throughout construction. The principal of the firm is a registered architect and professional planner, the onsite project manager previously worked for the SDA, and the other project manager proposed to be onsite is degreed specifically in construction management. They were able to describe many instances where

they had to use creative thinking and negotiating skills to ensure that projects were delivered on time and within budget. This recommendation will be made to the Board of Education at its meeting of April 24, 2017, scheduled to occur at 280 Park Avenue, Freehold, NJ 07728, at 7:00 p.m. A copy of the New Road proposal is available for public inspection in the Office of the Superintendent and the Business Administrator, 280 Park Avenue, Freehold, New Jersey 07728, during normal business hours. The office telephone number is 732 761 2105.

This report was prepared by Ted Del Guercio, III, Esquire, McManimon, Scotland & Baumann, LLC, in their capacity as special counsel to the District, as well as Rocco Tomazic, Superintendent, Joseph Howe, School Business Administrator and Patricia Saxton, Assistant School Business Administrator. All inquiries about this report or the procurement procedures outlines herein can be made to Mr. Del Guercio at 973-622-1800 or at tdelguercio@msbnj.com.